Managing Public Meetings in a Contentious Era

Presented by Larry Koman, Talyn Mirzakhanian, and Brendan Kearns
And a special thanks to *Fiona Kearns* for PowerPoint design advice
WHY PUBLIC MEETINGS MATTER

- Often a member of the public’s only non-services based interaction with the City
- Transparency and inclusion foster public trust
- Government “by the people”
“A GROWING PROBLEM”: DISRUPTIONS ON THE RISE

A 2022 report from the State Assembly Committee on the Judiciary:

“Public meetings, particularly those at the local government level . . . , are impacted by public behavior that is so disruptive and disrespectful that the meetings cannot continue, ultimately interfering with the public’s constitutional right to address local officials, express their preferences and grievances, and otherwise weigh in on important local issues affecting their community.”
“A GROWING PROBLEM”: DISRUPTIONS ON THE RISE

The Judiciary Committee’s report identified several examples of this troubling trend:

- The Mayor of Los Gatos faced targeted bullying and harassment efforts at public meetings, including anti-LGBTQ rhetoric.
- The Placentia-Yorba Linda Unified School Board was forced to end multiple meetings early due to meeting disruptions.
- San Diego Board of Supervisor meetings made national headlines, in part, due to racist comments and threats of violence.
THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK

“Those wise restraints that make men free.”

John MacArthur Maguire
A “RIGHT OF ACCESS…”

California Constitution, Art. 1, Sect. 3(b):

“The people have the right of access to information concerning the conduct of the people's business, and, therefore, the meetings of public bodies and the writings of public officials and agencies shall be open to public scrutiny.”
THE BROWN ACT
A POLICY OF OPEN GOVERNMENT

Government Code Sect. 54950:

“In enacting this chapter, the Legislature finds and declares that the public commissions, boards and councils and the other public agencies in this State exist to aid in the conduct of the people’s business. It is the intent of the law that their actions be taken openly and their deliberations be conducted openly.”
OPEN MEETING RULE

Government Code Sect. 54953(a):

“All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter”
AGENDA REQUIREMENTS

- Agendas must be publicly accessible and distributed in advance to those who request copies
- Agendas must be posted on the City’s website
- No discussion or action on items not posted on the agenda
  - Absolute rule for special meetings
  - Exceptions for regular meetings
EXCEPTIONS ALLOWING LIMITED DISCUSSION OF NON-AGENDA ITEMS

- Brief responses to public comments
- Questions for clarifications/refer to staff
- Brief announcement or report on activities
- Request for future report
- Agree to place item on future agenda
- Emergency situation exists requiring immediate action
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The public has a right to speak on:

- Any item within the subject matter jurisdiction of the body (regular meetings only)

- A specific item of business on the agenda (any meeting, including special and emergency meetings)
REGULATING PUBLIC SPEAKERS

Planning Commissions may adopt reasonable regulations of public participation, including, but not limited to the following:

- Time limits
- Follow the agenda
- Address only the Commission
- Speak in order or when recognized
REGULATING PUBLIC SPEAKERS

Planning Commission may **NOT:**

- Prohibit public criticism of the City or the Commission
- Require speakers to “register” before providing public comment
ADDRESSING DISRUPTION

The Planning Commission Chair may remove an individual from a meeting for *actual disruptive behavior* if the Chair first warns the individual that:

- Their behavior is disruptive, and
- Failure to cease their disruptive behavior could result in removal from the meeting
ADDRESSING DISRUPTION

- Behavior is disruptive only if it actually disrupts, disturbs, impedes, or renders infeasible the orderly conduct of the meeting.

- Disruptive behavior may include noncompliance with the Planning Commission’s established rules of decorum, such as speaking out of turn or exceeding established time limits.
EXTREME SITUATIONS

- If the individual disrupting the meeting is using force or a true threat of force, they may be removed without a prior warning to cease their behavior.

- If there is a willful interruption of a meeting by a group or groups so as to “render the orderly conduct of such meeting infeasible,” the room may be cleared and business can continue with the press allowed to stay.
POTENTIAL CRIMINAL PENALTIES

Under *Penal Code Section 403*, willful disruption or break-up of a lawful assembly or meeting is a misdemeanor.
TIPS FOR EFFECTIVE MEETINGS

“One important key to success is self-confidence. An important key to self-confidence is preparation.”

Arthur Ashe
PREPARE, PREPARE, PREPARE

- Read the staff report and attachments
- Provide staff with any questions you may have in advance of the meeting
- Questioning whether to bring up a non-agendized item at the meeting?
  - Ask the staff liaison in advance if there is an appropriate opportunity
- Confirm your attendance with the staff liaison in a timely manner
ROLE OF THE CHAIR

- Serves as Presiding Officer at Commission meetings and facilitates its proceedings
- Solicits opinions from Commissioners
- Ensures a focused discussion and fair process
R-E-S-P-E-C-T

- It is always best to treat the audience with respect and in a manner that responsible adults prefer to be treated—*even when the audience is rude or worse*.

- Serves as an example of thoughtful, dignified behavior.
RESPONDING TO RUDE (OR WORSE)
PUBLIC COMMENTARY

- Rise above it by ignoring it, smiling, and thanking each speaker for his/her comments
- Compliment good behavior
- Meet with the offenders privately to see if their concerns can be resolved
BODY LANGUAGE MATTERS

- Avoid (or at least minimize) nodding or shaking your head in response to public comments.
- Rolling your eyes, crossing your arms, turning your chair, etc. indicates to the speaker (and audience) that you are not listening.
- Making eye contact, sitting still, etc. indicates that you are listening.
ON THE DAIS . . .

- Minimize interruptions of staff presentations, unless there’s a pressing issue that needs further explanation or clarification: *Remember, you will have ample opportunity to weigh in later in the proceedings!*
- Listen carefully to your fellow Commissioners, even if you disagree
- Avoid distractions, especially texting
REDUCE THE INTIMIDATION FACTOR

- Keep the audience fully informed: *People are more likely to participate if they don’t feel lost and intimidated*
- Be firm about heckling, booing and harassment of other speakers or City staff
- Use study sessions to tackle difficult and time-consuming issues in a more informal setting
Thank you!

Any questions?
EFFICIENT PUBLIC MEETINGS ARE IMPORTANT

- A meeting will often be the only non-services based interaction a member of the public has with the agency.
- Public meetings establish the “face” of an agency.
- Transparency and inclusion build public trust, credibility, and confidence.
- Efficiency, process, and preparation are key.
A 2022 report from the State Assembly Committee on the Judiciary:

“Public meetings, particularly those at the local government level . . . , are impacted by public behavior that is so disruptive and disrespectful that the meetings cannot continue, ultimately interfering with the public’s constitutional right to address local officials, express their preferences and grievances, and otherwise weigh in on important local issues affecting their community.”

“A GROWING PROBLEM”: DISRUPTIONS ON THE RISE
The Judiciary Committee’s report identified several examples of this troubling trend:

- The Mayor of Los Gatos and her family faced targeted bullying and harassment efforts at public meetings, including anti-LGBTQ rhetoric.
- The Placentia-Yorba Linda Unified School Board was forced to end multiple meetings early due to meeting disruptions.
- Recent San Diego Board of Supervisor meetings have made national headlines, in part, due to racist comments and threats of violence.

“A GROWING PROBLEM”: DISRUPTIONS ON THE RISE
“Those wise restraints that make men free”

John MacArthur Maguire
“The people have the right of access to information concerning the conduct of the people's business, and, therefore, the meetings of public bodies and the writings of public officials and agencies shall be open to public scrutiny.”

California Constitution, Art. 1, Sect. 3(b)

A “RIGHT OF ACCESS….”
THE BROWN ACT
THE **RALPH M. BROWN ACT**
A POLICY OF OPEN GOVERNMENT

“In enacting this chapter, the Legislature finds and declares that the public commissions, boards and councils and the other public agencies in this State exist to aid in the conduct of the people's business. It is the intent of the law that their actions be taken openly and their deliberations be conducted openly.”

Gov. Code § 54950
OPEN MEETING RULE

“All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.”

Gov. Code § 54953(a)
AGENDA REQUIREMENTS

Agendas must be publicly accessible and distributed in advance to those who request copies.

Agenda must be posted on Agency's website.
AGENDA REQUIREMENTS

No discussion or action on items not on the posted agenda

- Absolute rule for special meetings
- Exceptions for regular meetings
Exceptions Allowing Limited Discussion of Non-agenda Items:

- Brief response to public comments
- Questions for clarification / refer to staff
- Brief announcement or report on activities
- Request for future report
- Agree to place item on future agenda
- Emergency situation exists requiring immediate action
Must establish a quorum to transact business

Default Rule: More than half the Commission (quorum 3 of 5 member commission)

A majority of a quorum is sufficient to make a decision (unless some special rule applies)

Less than a quorum can adjourn a meeting
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The public has a right to speak on:

- Any item within the subject matter jurisdiction of the body (regular meetings only)
- A specific item of business on the agenda (any meeting, including special and emergency meetings)
REGULATING PUBLIC SPEAKERS

Planning Commissions may adopt reasonable regulations of public participation, including, but not limited to the following:

- **Time limits**
- **Follow the agenda**
- **Address only the Commission**
- **Speak in order or when recognized**
REGULATING PUBLIC SPEAKERS

Planning Commissions may not:

- Prohibit public criticism of the City or the Commission
- Require speakers to “register” before providing public comment
ADDRESSING DISRUPTION

The Planning Commission Chair may remove an individual from a meeting for *actual disruptive behavior* if the Chair first warns the individual that:

- Their behavior is disruptive, and
- Failure to cease their disruptive behavior could result in removal from the meeting.
ADDRESSING DISRUPTION

- Behavior is disruptive only if it actually disrupts, disturbs, impedes, or renders infeasible the orderly conduct of the meeting.

- Disruptive behavior may include noncompliance with the Planning Commission’s established rules of decorum, such as speaking out of turn or exceeding established time limits.
EXTREME SITUATIONS

- If the individual disrupting the meeting is using force or a true threat of force, they may be removed without a prior warning to cease their behavior.

- If there is a willful interruption of a meeting by a group or groups so as to “render the orderly conduct of such meeting infeasible,” the room may be cleared and business can continue, with the press allowed to stay.
POTENTIAL CRIMINAL PENALTIES

Under *Penal Code Section 403*, willful disruption or break-up of a lawful assembly or meeting is a misdemeanor.
“One important key to success is self-confidence. An important key to self-confidence is preparation.”

Arthur Ashe

TIPS FOR EFFECTIVE MEETINGS
Read the staff report and attachments

Provide staff with any questions you may have in advance of the meeting

Questioning whether to bring up an non-agendized item at the meeting?

- **Ask the staff liaison in advance if there is an appropriate opportunity**

- Confirm your attendance with the staff liaison in a timely manner

**PREPARE, PREPARE, PREPARE, PREPARE**
Serves as Presiding Officer at Commission Meetings and facilities its proceedings

Solicits opinions from Commissioners

Ensures a focused discussion and fair process

Does Chair participate less?

- *Chair can participate in all discussion and in same manner; privilege to go last*
- *Chair can make and second any motion*
- It is always best to treat the audience with respect and in a manner that responsible adults prefer to be treated – **even when the audience is rude or worse**

- Serve as an example of thoughtful, dignified behavior

R-E-S-P-E-C-T
Responding to Vicious Public Commentary

- Rise above it by ignoring it, smiling, and thanking each speaker for his/her comments
- Periodically remind the audience to be civil and observe the City’s adopted rules of decorum
- Meet with the offenders privately to see if their concerns can be resolved
- Compliment good behavior
- Be aware of your body language, both positively and negatively
- Reaching for the microphone is a non-disruptive way to ask for the floor
- Crossing your arms, rolling your eyes, turning your chair, etc., indicates to the speaker that you are not listening
- Facing the speaker, sitting still, making eye contact, indicates that you are listening
Pay attention – It builds trust and credibility.

Listen carefully to your fellow Commissioners’ comments, even if you disagree

Avoid distractions, especially texting!
Keep the audience fully informed

- Tell people what is going on as you work through the agenda
- People are more likely to participate if they don’t feel lost and intimidated

Be firm about heckling, booing and harassment of other speakers or City staff

Use study sessions to tackle difficult and time-consuming issues in a more informal setting

REDUCE THE INTIMIDATION FACTOR
THANK YOU!